Longitudinal Administrative Data and Survey Data linkage: some problems and solutions

Lorraine Dearden 28th January 2016



Cohort & Longitudinal Studies Enhancement Resources



TITT

Key issues



- Panel surveys are increasingly obtaining permission to link to administrative data sets
 - Health data e.g. Hospital Episodes Data
 - Crime data held by MoJ
 - Economic data held by DWP/HMRC
 - Education data held by DfE, BIS, HESA, UCAS.....
- So far, it is education data from the National Pupil Database (NPD) which has been most widely linked
 - E.g. to ALSPAC, MCS, Next Steps, Understanding Society

What is the problem?

- For at least some of these longitudinal panels (e.g. MCS) the school identifier in this administrative data needs to be *anonymised* in order to ensure confidentiality of survey participants
 - The school identifier in the NPD the unique reference number URN is a publically available school identifier
 - I did a google search for Paddington Academy URN





Cohort & Longitudinal Studies Enhancement Resources



ШШ

But is it unique?



- The name URN suggests this identifier is *unique BUT* they are far from unique
 - Change if school changes status e.g. from comprehensive to academy
 - If schools merge
 - If boundary changes to local authorities occur
 - If the school moves site
 - •
- This becomes a huge problem if this identifier is anonymised as a researcher no longer knows if a school identifier changes is a real school move or simply a school changing status etc.....

Changes are large in any one year...



Motivation:

School identifiers (Unique Reference Number – URN) change due to changes in school structure.

ШШ



Cohort & Longitudinal Studies Enhancement Resources



Schools Database

Changing school identifiers are a problem!

Empirical research:

- How to construct a consistent panel of schools?
- How to adequately control for school-level prior attainment?
- How to control for school level clustering appropriately?

Education charities:

- How to maintain list of eligible schools?
- How to track attainment of schools involved in program?



Cohort & Longitudinal Studies Enhancement Resources





Schools Database

The Problem: Example

Merge LEASIS 2012 with LEASIS 2013 schools data...

_merge	Freq.	Percent	Cum. Some URNs	
master only (1)	1,253	4.90	4.90	
using only (2) matched (3)	1,236 23,092	4.83 90.27	9.73 Some URNs	
Total	25,581	100.00	only in 2013	closer 🗧

But only one unmatched school from 2012 actually closes between 2012 and 2013^{Enhancement Resources}



Cohort & Longitudinal Studies

It matters....



The Problem: Example

What is the impact of changing to academy on KS2 (age 11) Average Points Scores?

	Ignore changing URNs	Account for changing URNs
Change to academy between 2010/2011 and 2011/2012	1.054***	0.782***
Standard error	[0.190]	[0.190]
N (schools)	14,413	14,879



Administrative Data Research Centre

Cohort & Longitudinal Studies Enhancement Resources

England

Note: OLS regression also accounts for prior APS (2010/2011) and interaction between prior APS and change to academy status.

Schools Database



Solution – Database of Schools to merge school identifiers in adjacent years creating a consistent panel of schools:

- We have created a file which links schools between 1994 and 2014
- Will be updated to include 2015 data in next month
- Will be made publicly available (dataset and syntax)
 - Currently talking to DfE about how we can make this publically available





Schools Database

Solution – Database of Schools:

- 1. Make LEASIS* files consistent over time:
- Create phase of education variable based on number of pupils of each age.
- Make school type consistent over time (academy, maintained, college etc)
- Clean school names (e.g. change "Roman Catholic" to "rc")
- Add postcode from EduBase

*Note: LEASIS files are data for all school in England (including private schools) that Have been produced since 1994 with. Stopped being produced in 2015.

- Contain pupil numbers by age/gender, %FSM, Pupil Teacher Ratio, %SEN, Ethnicity etc....

- Can be linked to school results files at KS1, KS2, KS4 and KS5

closer



Schools Database

Solution – Database of Schools:

1. Make LEASIS files consistent over time

2. Link schools across years, for each year:

- Merge using URN
- If no link created, merge using LA and ESTAB
- If no link created, merge using postcode and clean school name
- If no link created, merge using postcode and phase of education
- If no link created, merge using postcode and ESTAB
- If no link created, merge using DfE individual level census data (if available)



Cohort & Longitudinal Studies Enhancement Resources



ШШ

Schools Database

Solution – Database of Schools:

- 1. Make LEASIS files consistent over time
- 2. Link schools across years, for each year
- 3. Link backwards and forwards over time:
 - Schools that convert have two rows
 - Schools that merge have multiple rows
 - Links can be traced whatever year the researcher starts from







Schools Database

Solution – Database of Schools:

- 1. Make LEASIS files consistent over time
- 2. Link schools across years, for each year
- 3. Link backwards and forwards over time
- Database provides information on school mergers, closures, opening and changes in school status.



Cohort & Longitudinal Studies Enhancement Resources



TITT

Administrative Data Research Centre England

3

Schools Database

urn	urn 2005	urn 2006	urn 2007	urn 2008	urn 2009	urn 2010	urn_2011	urn 2012	urn 2013	
100000	100000	100000	100000	100000	100000	100000	100000	100000	100000	
100001	100001	100001	100001	100001	100001	100001	100001	100001	100001	
100002	100002	100002	100002	100002	100002	100002	100002	100002	100002	
100003	100003	100003	100003	100003	100003	100003	100003	100003	100003	
100005	100005	100005	100005	100005	100005	100005	100005	100005	100005	
100006	100006	100006	100006	100006	100006	100006	100006	100006	100006	
100007	100007	100007	100007	100007	100007	100007	100007	100007	100007	
100008	100008	100008	100008	100008	100008	100008	100008	100008	100008	
100009	100009	100009	100009	100009	100009	100009	100009	100009	100009	
100010	100010	100010	100010	100010	100010	100010	100010	100010	100010	
100011	100011	100011	100011	100011	100011	100011	100011	100011	100011	
100012	100012	100012	100012	100012	100012	100012	100012	100012	100012	
100013	100013	100013	100013	100013	100013	100013	100013	100013	100013	
100014	100014	100014	100014	100014	100014	100014	100014	100014	100014	
100015	100015	100015	100015	100015	100015	100015	100015	100015	100015	
100018	100018	100018	100018	100018	100018	100018	100018	100018	100018	
100019	100019	100019	100019	100019	100019	100019	100019	100019	100019	
100020	100020	100020	100020	100020	100020	100020	100020	100020	100020	
100021	100021	100021	100021	100021	100021	100021	100021	100021	100021	~
100022	100022	100022	100022	100022	100022	100022	100022	100022	100022	
100023	100023	100023	100023	100023	100023	100023	100023	100023	100023	Cul
100024	100024	100024	100024	100024	100024	100024	100024	100024	100024	Cono
100025	100025	100025	100025	100025	100025	100025	100025	100025	100025	Enna
100026	100026	100026	100026	100026	100026	100026	100026	100026	100026	
100027	100027	100027	100027	100027	100027	100027	100027	100027	100027	
100028	100028	100028	100028	100028	100028	100028	100028	100028	100028	
100029	100029	100029	100029	100029	100029	100029	100029	100029	100029	
100030	100030	100030	100030	100030	100030	100030	100030	100030	100030	
100031	100031	100031	100031	100031	100031	100031	100031	100031	100031	6

Stable Schools





Schools Database

UPB	urn 2005	urn 2006	urn 2007	urn 2008	urn 2009	urn 2010	urn 2011	urn 2012	urn 2013
130388	126175	126175	130388	130388	130388	130389	130388	130388	130388
126175	126175	126175	130399	130399	130399	130388	130399	130399	130399
126341	126341	126341	130388	130399	130388	130389	130389	130388	130399
130391		130391	130391	130391	130391	130391	130391	130391	130391
130826		130826	130826	130826	130826	130826	130026	130826	130826
130854		130854	130854	130854	130854	130854	130854	130854	130854
130855		130855	130855	130655	30855	130855	130855	130855	130855
130856	100669	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856
100670	100670	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856
100669	100669	130856	130856	130856	130956	130856	130856	130856	130856
130857	-	130857	130857	130857	130857	130857	130857	130857	130857
125489	125489	125489	125489	125489	125489	130869	130869	130869	130869
130880		130880	130880	130880	130880	130880	130880	130880	130880
102877	102877	130899	130899	130					130899
102880	102880	130899	130899	130 No.	to: multi		nor ccho	al ac	130899
130899	102877	130899	130899	130 100	te: muiti	ple rows	per scho	or, as	130899
114883	114883	130901	130901	130 lin	ked forw:	ard and b	ackward	and	130901
130901	114880	130901	130901	130			activitation	unia	130901
114880	114880	130901	130901	130 inc	lude scho	ool merge	ers.		130901
130902		130902	130902	130	101				130902
130904	-	130904	130904	130 (Cľ	nurchfield	is, the vil	lage scho		130904
130907		130907	130907	130 607	mod fron	Atwart	h Primar	v School	130907
130908	111772	130908	130908	130	meu non	ALWOIL	in r minai	y school	130908
111772	111772	130908	130908	130 an/	d Monkte	on Farleic	th & Sout	th	130908
107462	107462	130909	130909	130	armonice	minancis	,		130909
130909	107462	130909	130909	130 Wr	raxall.)				130909
101150	101150	101150	130912	130					130912
130912	101150	101150	130912	130					130912
130913		130913	130913	130913	130913	130913	130913	130913	130913

Changing Schools

Cohort & Longitudinal Studies Enhancement Resources



Schools Database

UEB	uen 2005	urn 2006	urn 2007	urn 2008	urn 2009	urn 2010	urn 2011	urn 2012	urn 2013
130366	126175	126175	130388	130366	130366	130366	130388	130300	130366
126175	126175	126175	130388	130388	130388	130388	130388	130388	130388
126341	126341	126341	130388	130388	130386	130388	130388	130388	130388
130391	-	130391	130391	130391	130391	130391	130391	130391	130391
130826	-	130826	130826	130826	h 130826	130826	130826	130826	130826
130854	-	130854	130854	130854	130854	130854	130854	130854	130854
130855	-	130855	130855	130855	130855	130855	130855	130855	130855
130856	100669	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856
100670	100670	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856
100669	100669	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856	130856
130857		130857	130857	130857	130857	130857	130857	130857	130857
125489	125489	125489	125489	125489	125089	130869	130869	130869	130869
130990		130990	130990	130880	130890	130880	130990	130990	130990
102677	102677	130899	130899	130899	130839	130899	130899	130899	130899
102660	102660	130899	130899	130899	130899	130899	130899	130899	130699
130899	102877	130899	130899	130899	130899	130899	130899	130899	130899
114883	114883	130901	130901	130000	*****	400004	* ******		130901
130901	114880	130901	130901	130	4-1-1-0		Delete Lee		130901
114880	114880	130901	130901	130 AN	dalusia A	cademy	Bristol of	pened in	130901
130902	-	1.30902	130902	130 Co.	ntomhor	2005	-		130902
130904	-	130904	130904	130 50	ptember	2005			130904
130907		130907	130907	130					130907
130908	111772	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908
111772	111772	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908
107462	107462	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909
130909	107462	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909
101150	101150	101150	130912	130912	130912	130912	130912	130912	130912
130912	101150	101150	130912	130912	130912	130912	130912	130912	130912
130913		130913	130913	130913	130913	130913	130913	130913	130913

Changing Schools



Enhancement Resources



Schools Database

urn_2005	urn_2008	urn_2007	urn_2006	urn 2005	urn
130388	130388	130388	126175	126175	130388
130386	130399	130388	126175	126175	126175
130386	130399	130399	126341	126341	126341
130391	130391	130391	130391		130391
130826	130826	130826	130826		130826
130854	130854	130854	130854		130854
130855	130855	130855	130855		130855
130856	130856	130856	130856	100669	130856
10005	100055	**************************************	100000	100.000	100670

One for one change: North Westminster Community School became Paddington Academy

114883						130901	130901	130901	130901
130901	114880	130901	130901	130901	130901	130901	130901	130901	130901
114880	114880	130901	130901	130901	130901	130901	130901	130901	130901
130902	-	130902	130902	130902	130902	130902	130902	130902	130902
130904	-	130904	130904	130904	130904	130904	130904	130904	130904
130907		130907	130907	120907	130907	130907	130907	130907	130907
130908	111772	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908
111772	111772	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908	130908
107462	107462	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909
130909	107462	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909	130909	130303	130903
101150	101150	101150	130912	130912	130912	130912	130912	130912	130912
130912	101150	101150	130912	130912	130912	130912	130912	130912	130912
130913		130913	130913	130913	130913	130913	130913	130913	130913

urn 2010

urn 2011

Changing Schools

urn 2013

urn 2012



Cohort & Longitudinal Studies Enhancement Resources



Schools Database and Data linkage

Database of Schools: Linkage to Surveys

- In principle, any survey capturing school age children post-1993 can be matched to database of schools
 - > ALSPAC (1990/1991)
 - BHPS/Understanding Society (1991/2009)
 - > MCS (2000/2001)
 - ➢ LSYPE (2004).
- Most Importantly we can show from our database, we can say <u>why</u> an individuals school identifier changed before anonymisation in panel survey data
 - Extra variable in survey data:
 - Real school change; change of status of school (and what that change was) school merger; school closure etc really important for getting analysis right
 - E.g. in MCS can have anonymised school identifier for each year of school and if this changes for individual can say <u>why</u> this change occurred
 - At moment this has NOT been done in MCS (or other surveys)



Cohort & Longitudinal Studies Enhancement Resources



ΠПП

Conclusions



- Linkage to surveys carried out by data holders
- Data holders generally provide pseudonymised school identifiers which are consistent over time
- But reasons for changes in identifiers cannot be established once pseudonymised means longitudinal analysis using education data could be wrong – no problems for cross-sectional work
- Guidelines and approach are currently being established how we grant access to this resource....
- Applications are wider than for education data similar problems with changes in hospitals, prisons,



